

The Paradox of Empathic Communication in Islamic Education

(A Quantitative Analysis of Teacher-Student Interaction and Motivation in the Qur'an Memorization Program)

Ali Husan^{1*}, Neni Yulianita², Kiki Zakiah³, Siti Suriani Binti Othman⁴

^{1,2,3,4}Universitas Islam Bandung, Bandung, Indonesia



DOI : <https://doi.org/10.46245/ijorer.v7i1.1055>

Sections Info

Article history:

Submitted: August 16, 2025
Final Revised: January 16, 2026
Accepted: January 21, 2026
Published: January 30, 2026

Keywords:

Empathetic Communication;
Student Motivation; Qur'an
Memorization; Islamic
Education; Teacher-Student
Interaction



ABSTRACT

Objective: The relationship between empathetic communication by teachers and student learning motivation requires empirical verification in the context of traditional Islamic education, particularly in Qur'an memorization programs that emphasize an authoritative approach. This study addresses the knowledge gap regarding the motivational dynamics in Qur'an memorization learning, which has not been comprehensively documented. **Methods:** The study employed a cross-sectional survey design involving 83 students aged 15–18 years from four tafhidz institutions in the city and regency of Bandung through purposive sampling. **Result:** Empathetic communication was measured using the Dyadic Interpersonal Communication Scale ($\alpha = 0.916$), while motivation was assessed using the Quranic Memorization Motivation Scale, which includes intrinsic ($\alpha = 0.843$) and extrinsic ($\alpha = 0.811$) dimensions. Hierarchical multiple regression analysis was conducted with demographic variables controlled according to Self-Determination Theory. The data indicate that empathetic communication predicts intrinsic motivation ($\beta = -0.261$, $p = 0.015$) and extrinsic motivation ($\beta = -0.469$, $p < 0.001$). The final regression models explained 35.8% of the variance in intrinsic motivation and 51.9% in extrinsic motivation; however, these R^2 values reflect the combined contribution of empathetic communication and the controlled demographic variables (age, and memorization completion) with empathetic communication demonstrating a significant incremental effect beyond the controls. **Novelty:** These findings differ from Western educational theories, which predict a positive relationship, indicating that cultural context mediates the empathy-motivation relationship in traditional Islamic education. The study confirms the importance of adapting pedagogical approaches that consider local cultural values to optimize learning motivation in tafhidz programs.

INTRODUCTION

Although empathy is widely assumed to enhance student motivation, this assumption may not fully apply to educational contexts grounded in discipline and moral authority. In traditional Islamic Qur'an memorization (tafhidz) programs, teacher authority carries spiritual significance and shapes academic expectations. Empathy expressed beyond culturally appropriate limits may be perceived as reduced instructional rigor rather than support, suggesting a context-dependent role of empathy that warrants empirical examination (Hardaker & Sabki, 2018).

The practice of memorizing the Qur'an (*Hifz*) is one of the most enduring and fundamental traditions in Islamic education, serving both as a spiritual discipline and an intellectual endeavor that has persisted for over fourteen centuries (Japeri et al., 2023). This tradition, which involves the perfect memorization of the 6,236 verses of the Quran, serves as a cornerstone of the Islamic education system worldwide and shapes a unique pedagogical approach that significantly differs from conventional Western educational paradigms. Recent research indicates that students have nine distinct motivational

factors in participating in Quran memorization programs, including the desire for spiritual rewards, parental influence, and personal achievement goals (Japeri et al., 2023).

The teacher-student relationship in Islamic pedagogy is characterized by a distinctive hierarchical structure rooted in the concepts of *Tarbiyah* (holistic education) and *Ta'lim* (teaching), where the teacher acts as both a *Murshid* (spiritual guide) and a *Murabbi* (educator) (Wulandari & Hadinata, 2025). This relationship traditionally emphasizes a balance between *Rahmah* (compassion) and *Hikmah* (wisdom), creating a learning environment that combines emotional support with disciplinary rigor. The historical significance of empathetic guidance in Islamic education can be traced back to the teaching methodology of Prophet Muhammad, who emphasized understanding, patience, and a teaching approach tailored to individual characteristics while maintaining high standards of achievement.

Empathetic communication, defined as the ability to understand and feel others' emotions while maintaining appropriate emotional boundaries, has become a crucial component of effective teaching in various educational contexts (Aldrup et al., 2022). A recent systematic review identifies empathy as a key factor in teaching effectiveness, with significant relationships to the quality of teacher-student interactions and student learning outcomes (Aldrup et al., 2022). The theoretical framework for empathetic communication in education draws heavily on *DeVito's Interpersonal Communication Model*, which identifies empathy as one of the five essential dimensions of effective interpersonal interaction, alongside openness, support, positive attitude, and equality.

Contemporary research reveals that empathy is a central element in teacher-student interactions and plays a crucial role in students' academic achievement, although its impact is complex and context-dependent (Sun et al., 2023). Studies on language learning indicate a positive and significant relationship between teacher empathy and student engagement, particularly in English as a foreign language (*EFL*) learning (Z. Zhang, 2022). Recent research on the role of teacher empathy in student mental health also indicates that empathetic teacher-student relationships are correlated with reduced levels of stress, anxiety, and depression in students (Ampofo et al., 2025).

Although research in general education is quite abundant, there is a significant literature gap regarding empathetic communication in the context of Islamic religious education. This gap is even more pronounced in intensive religious learning environments, where traditional pedagogical approaches may differ significantly from Western educational models.

Motivational studies in the context of religious education present unique challenges that distinguish them from secular educational research. *Self-Determination Theory (SDT)* developed by Deci and Ryan provides a framework for understanding motivation through intrinsic and extrinsic perspectives, emphasizing the importance of autonomy, competence, and relatedness in maintaining learning engagement (Ryan & Deci, 2020). Recent research explores how teachers' empathy influences student motivation from a developmental perspective and reveals the complex interactions between empathetic motivation and student engagement (Ge et al., 2021).

In the context of the Qur'an memorization program, these motivational factors interact with spiritual, cultural, and social dimensions that are not generally found in conventional education. Empirical research has identified nine primary motivational factors in participating in tafhidz programs, including the expectation of divine reward, parental guidance, peer influence, and personal spiritual development goals (Japeri et al.,

2023). Unique challenges in Qur'an memorization programs include the intensive nature of learning, the demand for perfect accuracy in recitation, and the integration of spiritual development and cognitive achievement.

The cultural and spiritual dimensions of motivation in Islamic education transcend the traditional intrinsic-extrinsic dichotomy, encompassing concepts such as *Ikhlas* (sincerity), *Taqwa* (consciousness of Allah), and *Barakah* (divine blessing). These spiritual motivational factors form a complex motivational landscape, requiring careful consideration when applying Western psychological theories to the Islamic educational context.

The intersection between empathetic communication and student motivation in Islamic education remains largely unexplored, creating a knowledge gap that limits the development of evidence-based pedagogical approaches. This limitation is particularly evident in intensive religious programs such as *tahfidz*, where traditional Islamic pedagogical principles interact with modern educational psychology in complex and sometimes contradictory ways.

Current understanding of the influence of empathetic communication on student motivation in intensive religious programs is limited due to a lack of culturally sensitive research methodologies and instruments. Most research on empathetic communication in education has been conducted in Western and secular contexts, raising questions about the applicability of its findings in Islamic educational settings. The need for evidence-based approaches in Islamic education is becoming increasingly urgent as these institutions seek to balance traditional values with the best contemporary educational practices.

Furthermore, the potential tension between traditional Islamic pedagogy and modern educational theory remains unresolved. While Western educational psychology generally promotes high levels of empathy as beneficial for student motivation and achievement, traditional Islamic education emphasizes the importance of maintaining appropriate boundaries between teachers and students, so that excessive empathy may actually be counterproductive.

This study seeks to answer the main research question: *How does empathetic communication between teachers and students relate to student motivation in a Qur'an memorization program?* Sub-questions include: (1) How does empathetic communication influence intrinsic and extrinsic motivation differently in an Islamic educational context? (2) What are the implications of empathetic communication patterns for teacher training in Islamic educational institutions?

The specific objectives of this study are: (1) to measure the level of empathetic communication in teacher-student interactions in the Qur'an memorization program; (2) to assess the level of student motivation (both intrinsic and extrinsic) in this context; (3) to analyze the correlation between empathetic communication and various types of motivation; and (4) to provide evidence-based recommendations for educational practices and teacher training programs in Islamic educational institutions.

This study contributes to the understanding of empathy in religious education by presenting the first quantitative study that examines the relationship between empathetic communication and motivation in an Islamic educational setting. This research challenges universal assumptions of Western educational psychology theory and provides a basis for the development of a culturally sensitive theoretical framework that is consistent with the characteristics of Islamic pedagogy.

The findings of this study provide important insights for teacher training and pedagogical approaches in Islamic educational institutions through empirical evidence on the optimization of teacher-student communication patterns. This study offers practical guidance for institution administrators, teacher trainers, and Islamic education policymakers in their efforts to enhance student motivation while maintaining traditional pedagogical values.

This research bridges Western educational psychology with Islamic pedagogical principles, while enriching understanding of the effectiveness of cross-cultural education. The study emphasizes the importance of cultural sensitivity in educational research and provides a culturally appropriate research model for religious education contexts.

RESEARCH METHOD

Research Design

This study employs a quantitative cross-sectional survey design to examine the relationship between teachers' empathetic communication and students' motivation in the context of Islamic education, specifically the Qur'an memorization program. The cross-sectional approach was chosen to capture the current relationship between variables, while acknowledging its limitations in establishing causal relationships.

Research Setting

Data collection was conducted at four Islamic boarding schools in the city and regency of Bandung, which have special programs for memorizing the Qur'an (tauhid), from March to May 2024. The institutions were selected based on the reputation of their intensive memorization programs and their willingness to participate in educational research.

Sampling Techniques and Sample Size Determination

This study used purposive sampling to recruit participants from intensive tauhid programs. The sample size was calculated using G*Power 3.1.9.7 software for multiple regression analysis with a medium effect size ($f^2 = 0.15$), $\alpha = 0.05$, power = 0.80, and two predictors. This calculation resulted in a minimum of 68 participants. The final sample consisted of 83 students, exceeding the minimum requirement by 22%.

Participant Characteristics

A total of 83 students participated (response rate: 89.2%) with the following inclusion criteria:

1. Have actively participated in a memorization program for at least six months
2. Aged between 15-18 years
3. Voluntarily agreed to participate

Exclusion criteria included students with documented learning disabilities or those planning to withdraw from the program during the study period.

Sample characteristics:

1. Average age: 16.4 years (SD = 1.2)
2. Gender distribution: 48 males (57.8%), 35 females (42.2%)
3. Average program duration: 2.3 years (range: 6 months - 4 years)
4. Average memorization achievement: 8.7 juz (SD = 4.2)

Research instruments

Empathic Communication Scale

Dyadic Interpersonal Communication Scale Empathy Subscale (Richmond & McCroskey, 1990) adapted for the Islamic education context. The subscale consists of 12 items measuring students' perceptions of teachers' empathetic communication behavior (e.g., "My teacher understands my feelings about memorizing the Qur'an"). Assessment uses a 5-point Likert scale (1 = strongly disagree, 5 = strongly agree). This adapted version shows very high internal reliability ($\alpha = 0.916$) and adequate construct validity based on confirmatory factor analysis (CFI = 0.942, RMSEA = 0.078).

Student Motivation in Memorizing the Quran

The Motivation in Quranic Memorization Scale was specifically developed to measure two dimensions of motivation: First, the Intrinsic Motivation Subscale (14 items, $\alpha = 0.843$): Measures personal satisfaction and fulfillment derived from memorizing the Quran (example: "I memorize the Quran because it gives me inner peace"). Second, the Extrinsic Motivation Subscale (15 items, $\alpha = 0.811$): Measures motivation driven by external rewards or recognition (e.g., "I memorize the Quran to receive praise from my teacher"). Both subscales use a 5-point Likert scale. Factor analysis confirmed a two-factor structure with eigenvalue values > 1.0 and factor loadings > 0.50 .

Research Procedure

Data collection was conducted using a standard protocol by trained research assistants during regular class hours. Questionnaire completion took approximately 25 minutes under direct supervision. Participants were assured of confidentiality and given the right to withdraw without consequences.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Result

Preliminary Analysis

Assumption Tests

All statistical assumptions for hierarchical multiple regression analysis were well met. The Shapiro-Wilk test showed a normal distribution for all variables: empathetic communication ($W = 0.976$, $p = 0.084$), intrinsic motivation ($W = 0.979$, $p = 0.119$), and extrinsic motivation ($W = 0.981$, $p = 0.104$). Multicollinearity is not an issue, with all VIF values below 2.5. The Durbin-Watson statistic ($d = 1.89$) indicates residual independence, and visual inspection of scatterplots confirms the absence of homoscedasticity.

Reliability and Validity Tests

The internal consistency reliability coefficients exceeded the acceptable threshold for all instruments. The adapted *Dyadic Interpersonal Communication Scale – Empathy subscale* demonstrated excellent reliability ($\alpha = 0.916$). The newly developed *Quranic Memorization Motivation Scale* showed good reliability on the intrinsic motivation subscale ($\alpha = 0.843$) and extrinsic motivation subscale ($\alpha = 0.811$).

Construct validity was supported through confirmatory factor analysis. The empathy scale showed an acceptable *model fit* (CFI = 0.942, RMSEA = 0.078), while the motivation scale confirmed a clear two-factor structure with eigenvalues greater than 1.0 and *factor loadings* above 0.50 for all items.

Descriptive Statistics

Empathic communication scores ranged from 2.1 to 4.8 ($M = 3.4$, $SD = 0.7$), indicating that teachers' perceived empathy levels were in the moderate category. Intrinsic motivation scores were relatively high ($M = 4.1$, $SD = 0.6$, range: 2.3–5.0), while extrinsic motivation showed greater variation ($M = 3.2$, $SD = 0.8$, range: 1.4–4.9).

Table 1. Descriptive Statistics and Intercorrelations Among Study Variables

Variable	M	SD	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
Age	1	1.2	—						
Gender†	—	—	.12	—					
Program duration (years)	2.3	1.1	.34**	-.08	—				
Memorization completion (Juz)	8.7	4	.41**	.05	.67**	—			
Empathetic communication	3	0	-.18	.09	-.21	-.23*	—		
Intrinsic motivation	4.	0	.28*	-.15	.45**	.52**	-.35**	—	
Extrinsic motivation	3	0	.19	.11	.38**	.44**	-.51**	.62**	—

Note. $N = 83$. †Gender coded as 0 = male, 1 = female. * $p < .05$. ** $p < .01$.

Main Analysis

Hierarchical Multiple Regression: Intrinsic Motivation

Hierarchical multiple regression was conducted to examine the relationship between empathetic communication and intrinsic motivation, while controlling for demographic variables.

Table 2. Hierarchical Regression Analysis Predicting Intrinsic Motivation

Variable	Step		Step	
	β	t	β	t
Age	.375***	3.82	.380***	4.21
Gender	-.079	-0.85	-.079	-0.95
Program duration	.199*	1.98	.199	2.12
Memorization completion	.570***	5.64	.570***	6.38
Empathetic communication	—	—	-.261*	-2.48
R	.423		.519	
ΔR^2	—		.096**	
F	14.26***		16.71***	

Note. $N = 83$. * $p < .05$. ** $p < .01$. *** $p < .001$.

In the first step, demographic variables explained 42.3% of the variation in intrinsic motivation, $F(4, 78) = 14.26$, $p < 0.001$. The addition of empathetic communication in the second step significantly increased the explained variation, $\Delta R^2 = 0.096$, $F(1, 77) = 15.31$, $p < 0.001$. The final model explains 51.9% of the variation in intrinsic motivation, $F(5, 77) = 16.71$, $p < 0.001$.

Contrary to theoretical predictions, empathetic communication negatively predicted intrinsic motivation ($\beta = -0.261$, $t = -2.48$, $p = 0.015$) with a moderate effect ($f^2 = 0.56$). Among the control variables, memory achievement ($\beta = 0.570$, $p < 0.001$) and age ($\beta = 0.380$, $p < 0.001$) were significant positive predictors.

Hierarchical Multiple Regression: Extrinsic Motivation

Parallel analysis was conducted to examine the relationship between empathetic communication and extrinsic motivation.

Table 3. Hierarchical Regression Analysis Predicting Extrinsic Motivation

Variable	Step		Step	
	β	t	β	t
Age	.507***	4.85	.506***	5.73
Gender	.024	0.24	.024	0.29
Program duration	.152	1.44	.152	1.71
Memorization completion	.537***	5.01	.537***	6.09
Empathetic communication	—	—	-.469***	-4.89
R	.341		.588	
ΔR^2	—		.247***	
F	10.08***		22.04***	

Note. N = 83. * $p < .05$. ** $p < .01$. *** $p < .001$.

Demographic variables in the first step explained 34.1% of the variation in extrinsic motivation, $F(4, 78) = 10.08$, $p < 0.001$. The addition of empathetic communication in the second step resulted in a significant increase in the explained variation, $\Delta R^2 = 0.247$, $F(1, 77) = 46.38$, $p < 0.001$. The final model explains 58.8% of the variation in extrinsic motivation, $F(5, 77) = 22.04$, $p < 0.001$.

Empathetic communication shows a strong negative relationship with extrinsic motivation ($\beta = -0.469$, $t = -4.89$, $p < 0.001$) with a large effect ($f^2 = 1.08$). Age ($\beta = 0.506$, $p < 0.001$) and memorization achievement ($\beta = 0.537$, $p < 0.001$) remained significant positive predictors.

Further Analysis

Comparison of Effect Sizes

The negative relationship between empathetic communication and motivation differs significantly based on the type of motivation. According to Cohen's guidelines, the relationship with intrinsic motivation has a moderate effect ($f^2 = 0.56$), while the relationship with extrinsic motivation has a large effect (, $f^2 = 1.08$). This indicates the presence of different underlying mechanisms for each type of motivation.

Confidence Interval

The 95% confidence interval for the empathetic communication coefficient is:

1. Intrinsic motivation: $\beta = -0.261$, CI [-0.468, -0.054]
2. Extrinsic motivation: $\beta = -0.469$, CI [-0.656, -0.282]

Both confidence intervals do not include the zero value, confirming the statistical significance of the negative relationship.

Additional Correlation Analysis

Bivariate correlation shows that empathetic communication is negatively correlated with intrinsic motivation ($r = -0.35$, $p < 0.01$) and extrinsic motivation ($r = -0.51$, $p < 0.01$). The stronger correlation with extrinsic motivation is consistent with the regression findings, indicating that empathetic communication has a greater negative impact on externally motivated behavior.

Summary of Key Findings

This study yielded three main findings that challenge common assumptions about empathetic communication in education:

1. Negative Empathy-Motivation Relationship – Contrary to theoretical predictions and the majority of previous research, teachers' empathetic communication negatively predicted both types of student motivation in the context of Quran memorization.

2. Differential Effects Based on Motivation Type – The negative effect is stronger for extrinsic motivation ($\beta = -0.469$, $f^2 = 1.08$) than for intrinsic motivation ($\beta = -0.261$, $f^2 = 0.56$).
3. Large Effect Size Despite the counterintuitive results, this relationship demonstrates substantial practical significance, with medium to large effect sizes exceeding conventional thresholds for meaningful educational interventions.

These findings suggest that the relationship between teacher empathy and student motivation may be more complex and context-dependent than previously understood, particularly in traditional religious educational settings that emphasize hierarchical teacher-student relationships and academic rigor.

Discussion

Interpretation of Key Findings The Empathy Paradox

1. The Empathy Paradox in Islamic Education

Contrary to dominant Western theory, this study found a statistically significant negative relationship between teachers' empathetic communication and students' intrinsic motivation ($\beta = -0.261$) and extrinsic motivation ($\beta = -0.469$) in a Qur'an memorization program. These findings challenge the assumption that teacher empathy always provides universal benefits (Aldrup et al., 2022; Zhang, 2022), and instead suggest the existence of a cultural paradox in highly structured Islamic learning environments where increased teacher empathy may be interpreted by students as a decrease in academic expectations or a relaxation of learning standards.

These results deviate from the common assumption in educational psychology that empathy universally increases motivation (Sarwer et al., 2024). This deviation underscores the need to revisit the *one-size-fits-all* approach in teacher-student affective dynamics in the global educational context.

This interpretation aligns with concerns raised by previous research, where excessive empathy has the potential to reduce student independence and increase dependency (Ampofo et al., 2025; Y. S. D. Zhang & Noels, 2024). In the context of Islamic pedagogy, which places discipline, authority, and spiritual development at the core of empathy, teachers' empathy without clear boundaries may disrupt students' perceptions of the seriousness of learning and reduce their motivation to learn (Okonofua et al., 2016).

The main findings of this study reveal an unexpected negative correlation between teachers' empathetic communication and students' learning motivation (-0.388), contrary to most general educational literature. These results present a paradox that requires in-depth interpretation within the context of Islamic education.

This unexpected negative correlation can be explained through several theoretical perspectives. First, over-empathy or excessive empathy may reduce the academic rigor required in learning. When teachers are overly empathetic, they may tend to lower academic standards or provide excessive leniency, which can actually reduce students' intrinsic motivation to achieve (Davis, 2006). Second, in the context of Islamic education, there are traditional values that emphasize discipline and hierarchical structures in teacher-student relationships. Excessive empathy may be interpreted as a weakness in the teacher's authority, which in traditional Islamic culture is considered important for creating an effective learning environment. Third, there is a possibility of conceptual confusion between empathy and permissiveness in the context of this study. Students may interpret empathetic communication from teachers as a sign of low expectations

toward them, which paradoxically reduces their motivation to achieve. This aligns with the findings of Y. S. D. Zhang & Noels (2024) in (Y. S. D. Zhang & Noels, 2024) , which indicate that in certain cultural contexts, teacher empathy can be perceived as an indicator of low academic standards.

Differential Impact on Types of Motivation

2. Differences in Influence on Intrinsic and Extrinsic Motivation

This study also found that the negative relationship between empathy and motivation is stronger for extrinsic motivation (large effect, $f^2 = 1.08$) compared to intrinsic motivation (moderate effect, $f^2 = 0.56$). These findings indicate that while both types of motivation are affected, motivation derived from external factors such as praise, recognition, and rewards is more sensitive to changes in teacher behavior. Excessive empathy may unintentionally weaken extrinsic motivation by reducing performance-based expectations (Rith-Najarian et al., 2014) . This phenomenon is related to the concept of empathy fatigue, where the natural capacity for caring becomes excessive and can lead to a decline in maintaining strict performance standards (Figley, 2002) . Research indicates that when teachers overly focus on empathetic aspects, they may lower their academic expectations of students, which can ultimately hinder students' extrinsic motivation to achieve (Hornstra et al., 2018). Conversely, intrinsic motivation stemming from internal satisfaction and spiritual fulfillment demonstrates greater resilience, consistent with the premise of Self-Determination Theory that intrinsic drives are more resistant to external changes (Ryan & Deci, 2020) . Nevertheless, this negative trend still indicates that empathetic communication that is not aligned can subtly erode students' internal motivation when perceived as a form of leniency.

It is highly likely that students in a tahfidz environment view excessive empathy as a weakening of the expected discipline, especially when spiritual goals are closely linked to perseverance and self-control. Therefore, understanding students' interpretations of teachers' behavior becomes a crucial factor. Further analysis shows that the negative impact of teachers' empathetic communication is stronger on extrinsic motivation (-0.469) than on intrinsic motivation (-0.261). This difference provides important insights into the psychological mechanisms involved in the empathy-motivation relationship.

The stronger negative effect on extrinsic motivation can be explained through the self-determination theory developed by Ryan & Deci (2020) . Highly empathetic teachers may tend to reduce external pressure and the reward-punishment system traditionally used to motivate students extrinsically. In the context of Islamic education, where assessment systems and academic competition often serve as strong external motivators, reducing this pressure can significantly decrease students' extrinsic motivation.

Conversely, intrinsic motivation demonstrates greater resilience to empathetic teacher communication. This suggests that motivation originating from within students is more stable and less susceptible to changes in teacher communication style. These findings align with research by Cooper (2004) and Warren (2017) , which indicate that intrinsic motivation tends to be more resistant to external factors compared to extrinsic motivation.

Contextual Considerations

3. Cultural Context and Pedagogical Implications

Traditionally, Islamic pedagogy combines compassion (*rahmah*) with wisdom (*hikmah*), forming a framework in which emotional support is valued, yet remains within

the bounds of respect and discipline (Wulandari & Hadinata, 2025). In this context, empathy is not something to be rejected, but must be expressed appropriately according to cultural norms, while maintaining the moral and spiritual authority of the teacher.

This finding emphasizes the importance of culturally calibrated teacher training (Warren, 2018). Empathy, when conveyed through Islamic values such as *ikhlas* (sincerity) and *ta'dib* (d manners), can remain an asset without weakening teaching authority (Hardaker & Sabki, 2018; Taufikin et al., 2025). This highlights the need for a contextual pedagogical framework that integrates affective and disciplinary aspects in a balanced manner (Bialystok & Kukar, 2017).

Policy makers and boarding school administrators may consider developing specialized training modules to equip tahfidz teachers with the ability to balance affective communication with structured discipline, so that empathy serves to strengthen, rather than diminish, pedagogical authority (Sacre et al., 2023; Jaffe et al., 2025).

The cultural and philosophical context of Islamic education provides an important interpretive framework for understanding the findings of this study (Hardaker & Sabki, 2018). In Islamic educational philosophy, there is a delicate balance between *rahma* (compassion) and *hikmah* (wisdom). Teachers in the Islamic tradition are expected to show compassion toward students while also maintaining authority and high academic standards (Safa, 2024).

The integration of traditional and modern approaches in Islamic education faces its own challenges (Warren, 2018). Empathetic communication derived from Western educational theory may not be fully compatible with hierarchical values in traditional Islamic education (Bialystok & Kukar, 2018). This creates tension between the desire to implement modern pedagogical practices and the preservation of deeply rooted traditional values.

Cultural sensitivity is also an important factor in understanding these findings (Lin & Chung, 2024). The concept of empathy in a Western context may have different connotations and expectations in Indonesian culture and Islamic education (Warren, 2017). Further research is needed to explore how the concept of empathy can be adapted to local and religious values (Jaffe et al., 2025).

Comparison with Previous Research

The findings of this study show limited alignment with some studies indicating negative effects of teacher empathy. Y. S. D. Zhang & Noels (2024) in their study found that in certain cultural contexts, excessive teacher empathy can reduce academic expectations and ultimately lower student achievement. However, these findings contrast with the majority of the literature showing a positive relationship between teacher empathy and student achievement and motivation.

Previous research consistently indicates that teacher empathy can enhance students' academic achievement, learning motivation, and the quality of teacher-student relationships. Studies by Cadima et al., (2015), Warren (2017), and Prananto et al., (2025) all demonstrate a positive correlation between teacher empathy and various positive student outcomes.

The unique contribution of this study lies in its focus on the Islamic education context, which has not been extensively explored in the international literature. As the first quantitative study specifically examining the relationship between teacher empathy and student motivation in an Islamic education setting, this research offers new insights into

how cultural and religious factors may moderate the relationship between teacher empathy and student outcomes.

Theoretical Implications of Empathetic Communication Theory

4. Theoretical Contributions

This study expands DeVito's *Interpersonal Communication Model* by showing that the effectiveness of empathy is not a universal trait but depends on context. These findings also refine *Self-Determination Theory* by highlighting that *relatedness* facilitated by empathy can interact differently with student motivation in hierarchical educational systems. The concept of *empathy paradox* that emerges from this study provides a more culturally nuanced perspective in the global discourse on teacher-student interaction.

These findings indicate the need for contextual adaptation in empathetic communication theory, particularly in religious educational settings. Theories originating from Western contexts may need to be reformulated when applied to Islamic education, which is rich in hierarchical structures and traditional values. The integration of Islamic pedagogical principles such as *adab* (ethics), *ta'dib* (character education), and *ta'lim* (knowledge transfer) is crucial and needs to be harmonized with modern empathetic communication theory to create a culturally relevant framework.

Theory of Motivation in a Religious Context

This study also expands motivation theory by emphasizing cultural specificity, where spiritual motivation has the potential to become a third dimension beyond the common intrinsic-extrinsic motivation dichotomy. In Islamic education, the dynamics of teacher authority are not only based on academic competence but also grounded in moral and spiritual authority factors that influence students' responses to teacher empathy.

Practical Implications

Teacher Training Programs

The research findings emphasize the importance of balance in empathetic communication training. Training programs need to internalize cultural sensitivity, with an awareness that forms of empathy that are effective in one culture may not be effective in another. Islamic pedagogical values must be integrated so that teachers can express empathy without losing authority or academic standards, in line with the principle of balance between *rahmah* (compassion) and *hikmah* (wisdom).

Institutional Policies

Islamic educational institutions need to formulate guidelines for teacher-student interaction that accommodate traditional values while adopting effective modern educational practices. Evaluations of teacher communication effectiveness should consider cultural and religious dimensions. In addition, teacher professional development frameworks should include ongoing training in expressing empathy in ways that maintain motivation in the context of Islamic education.

Limitations

This study has several limitations. First, the relatively small sample size ($N = 83$) limits the generalizability of the findings; further research with a larger and more representative sample is needed. Second, the *cross-sectional* design does not allow for the determination of causal relationships; a longitudinal design is needed to track the influence of teacher empathy on motivation from one time to another. Third, these findings

are specific to the context of Islamic education in Indonesia and may not be applicable to other cultural contexts, including Islamic institutions in different countries. Fourth, the use of measurement instruments developed in the West may not fully capture local cultural and religious nuances. Finally, contextual variables such as institutional factors, school organizational culture, and broader social dynamics were not measured in this study.

Future Research Directions

Further research is recommended to adopt a longitudinal design, involve multiple research sites (*multi-site*), and utilize qualitative approaches to understand students' perceptions of empathy in Islamic educational settings. The development of culturally adapted instruments is also essential to accurately measure teachers' empathy outside Western contexts.

CONCLUSION

Based on quantitative analysis of 83 students in the Al-Qur'an memorization program at several leading Islamic boarding schools, this study found that teachers' empathetic communication is significantly negatively correlated with students' learning motivation, both intrinsic ($\beta = -0.261$, $p = 0.015$) and extrinsic ($\beta = -0.469$, $p < 0.001$). This negative effect is stronger on extrinsic motivation than intrinsic motivation, indicating the presence of different psychological mechanisms at work on the two types of motivation.

The answer to the main research question shows that, contrary to the dominant assumption in Western literature, teacher empathy in the context of traditional Islamic education does not always increase motivation. Instead, over-empathy can be interpreted by students as a decrease in academic expectations or lax standards, which actually erodes the drive to learn, especially motivation that comes from external incentives.

For the first sub-question, findings indicate that extrinsic motivation is far more vulnerable to the negative effects of excessive empathy because it depends on performance expectations, rewards, and formal recognition. In contrast, intrinsic motivation rooted in internal satisfaction and spiritual goals demonstrates greater resilience, although it remains affected. This phenomenon expands *Self-Determination Theory* by emphasizing the need to consider spiritual motivation as a third dimension unique to Islamic education.

Addressing the second question, the practical implication is the need for culturally sensitive teacher training modules that integrate the principles of *rahmah* (compassion) and *hikmah* (wisdom) with rigorous academic discipline. Teachers need to be trained to express empathy within limits that maintain moral and spiritual authority, so that emotional support strengthens, rather than weakens, student motivation.

Thus, this study contributes two important insights: first, it introduces the concept of the "empathy paradox," challenging the universalism of empathetic communication theory in education; second, it offers a theoretical and practical foundation for designing teaching strategies in Islamic educational institutions that preserve the integrity.

REFERENCES

Aldrup, K., Carstensen, B., & Klusmann, U. (2022). Is Empathy the Key to Effective Teaching? A Systematic Review of Its Association with Teacher-Student Interactions and Student Outcomes. In *Educational Psychology Review* (Vol. 34, Issue 3). Springer

US. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10648-021-09649-y>

Ampofo, J., Bentum-Micah, G., Xusheng, Q., Sun, B., & Mensah Asumang, R. (2025). Exploring the role of teacher empathy in student mental health outcomes: a comparative SEM approach to understanding the complexities of emotional support in educational settings. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 16(March). <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2025.1503258>

Bialystok, Lauren, & Kukar, Polina. (2017). Authenticity and empathy in education. *Theory and Research in Education*, 16(1), 23-39. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1477878517746647>

Cadima, J., Doumen, S., Verschueren, K., & Buyse, E. (2015). Child engagement in the transition to school: Contributions of self-regulation, teacher-child relationships and classroom climate. *Early Childhood Research Quarterly*, 32, 1-12. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecresq.2015.01.008>

Cooper, B. (2004). Empathy, Interaction and Caring: Teachers' Roles in a Constrained Environment. *Pastoral Care in Education*, 22(3), 12-21. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.0264-3944.2004.00299.x>

Davis, H. (2006). Exploring the Contexts of Relationship Quality between Middle School Students and Teachers. *The Elementary School Journal*, 106, 193-223. <https://doi.org/10.1086/501483>

Figley, C. R. (2002). Compassion fatigue: psychotherapists' chronic lack of self care. *Journal of Clinical Psychology*, 58(11), 1433-1441. <https://doi.org/10.1002/jclp.10090>

Ge, Y., Li, W., Chen, F., Kayani, S., & Qin, G. (2021). The Theories of the Development of Students: A Factor to Shape Teacher Empathy From the Perspective of Motivation. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 12(November), 1-9. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2021.736656>

Hardaker, G., & Sabki, A. A. (2018). *Pedagogy in Islamic Education: The Madrasah Context*. Emerald Publishing Limited. <https://doi.org/10.1108/9781787545311>

Hornstra, L., Stroet, K., van Eijden, E., Goudsblom, J., & Roskamp, C. (2018). Teacher expectation effects on need-supportive teaching, student motivation, and engagement: a self-determination perspective. *Educational Research and Evaluation*, 24(3-5), 324-345. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13803611.2018.1550841>

Jaffe, M., Kafle, M., Kelly, E. K., & Tam, B. (2025). Finding a pedagogy of empathy in a Common Read Project. *Teaching in Higher Education*, 30(2), 396-411. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13562517.2024.2324727>

Japeri, J., Lisa, M., Maradona, M., Syamsuardi, S., & Siddiq, M. (2023). Students' Nine Motivation in Attending Program of Quran Memorization. *International Journal of Multidisciplinary Research of Higher Education*, 6(3), 136-146. <https://doi.org/10.24036/ijmuhica.v6i3.140>

Lin, S.-Y., & Chung, K. K. H. (2024). Linking teacher empathy to multicultural teaching competence: The mediating role of multicultural beliefs. In *Social Psychology of Education: An International Journal* (p. No Pagination Specified-No Pagination Specified). Springer. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11218-024-09893-4>

Okonofua, J. A., Paunesku, D., & Walton, G. M. (2016). Brief intervention to encourage empathic discipline cuts suspension rates in half among adolescents. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America*, 113(19), 5221-5226. <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1523698113>

Prananto, K., Cahyadi, S., Lubis, F. Y., & Hinduan, Z. R. (2025). Perceived teacher support

and student engagement among higher education students – a systematic literature review. *BMC Psychology*, 13(1), 112. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s40359-025-02412-w>

Rith-Najarian, L. R., McLaughlin, K. A., Sheridan, M. A., & Nock, M. K. (2014). The biopsychosocial model of stress in adolescence: self-awareness of performance versus stress reactivity. *Stress (Amsterdam, Netherlands)*, 17(2), 193-203. <https://doi.org/10.3109/10253890.2014.891102>

Ryan, R. M., & Deci, E. L. (2020). Intrinsic and extrinsic motivation from a self-determination theory perspective: Definitions, theory, practices, and future directions. *Contemporary Educational Psychology*, 61, 101860. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cedpsych.2020.101860>

Sacre, M., Ries, N., Wolf, K., & Kunter, M. (2023). Teachers' well-being and their teaching quality during the COVID-19 pandemic: a retrospective study. *Frontiers in Education*. <https://doi.org/10.3389/feduc.2023.1136940>

Safa, A. (2024). Revolutionizing initial teacher education: Embracing Prophet Muhammad's pedagogy for inclusive empowerment. *Journal of Research in Islamic Education*, 6(June), 18-46. <https://doi.org/10.25217/jrie.v6i1.4513>

Sarwer, S., Tariq, A., & Abid, M. N. (2024). Impact of Teacher Empathy and Motivation on Student Academic Achievement: Mediated by Sense of School Belongingness. *Journal of Higher Education and Development Studies (JHEDS)*, 4(1), 264-281. <https://doi.org/10.59219/jheds.04.01.64>

Sun, B., Wang, Y., Ye, Q., & Pan, Y. (2023). Associations of Empathy with Teacher-Student Interactions: A Potential Ternary Model. *Brain Sciences*, 13(5). <https://doi.org/10.3390/brainsci13050767>

Taufikin, T., Nurhayati, S., & Harun, M. (2025). Reimagining Classroom Equality: An Academic Inquiry into Surah Al-Fatiyah's Core Values for Inclusivity in Education. *Dinamika Ilmu*, 25(1 SE-Articles). <https://doi.org/10.21093/di.v25i1.10008>

Warren, Chezare A. (2017). Empathy, Teacher Dispositions, and Preparation for Culturally Responsive Pedagogy. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 69(2), 169-183. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0022487117712487>

Wulandari, D., & Hadinata, A. B. (2025). Implementation Of The Nadhliyah Method In Enhancing Children's Spiritual Intelligence At Quran Memorization Center At Taqwa Binjai. *International Jurnal Islamic Education, Research and Multiculturalism (IJIERM)*, 7(1), 369-368. <https://doi.org/DOI:10.47006/ijierm.v7i1.458>

Zhang, Y. S. D., & Noels, K. A. (2024). Understanding the interrelations between cultural empathy, intercultural communication competence, and the psychosocial adjustment of international students in Canada: A longitudinal examination. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, 102, 102023. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijintrel.2024.102023>

Zhang, Z. (2022). Toward the Role of Teacher Empathy in Students' Engagement in English Language Classes. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 13(June), 1-8. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2022.880935>



*** Ali Husan (Corresponding Author)**

Doctoral Program in Communication Sciences, Faculty of Communication,
Universitas Islam Bandung, Bandung, Indonesia.
Jl. Tamansari No. 20, Tamansari, Bandung Wetan District, Bandung City, West Java 40116
Email: aba.farih@gmail.com

Neni Yulianita

Doctoral Program in Communication Sciences, Faculty of Communication,
Universitas Islam Bandung, Bandung, Indonesia.
Jl. Tamansari No. 20, Tamansari, Bandung Wetan District, Bandung City, West Java 40116
Email: neni.yulianti@gmail.com

Kiki Zakiah

Doctoral Program in Communication Sciences, Faculty of Communication,
Universitas Islam Bandung, Bandung, Indonesia.
Jl. Tamansari No. 20, Tamansari, Bandung Wetan District, Bandung City, West Java 40116
Email: kiki.zakiah@gmail.com

Siti Suriani Binti Othman

Doctoral Program in Communication Sciences, Faculty of Communication,
Universitas Islam Bandung, Bandung, Indonesia.
Jl. Tamansari No. 20, Tamansari, Bandung Wetan District, Bandung City, West Java 40116
Email: sitti_surianti@gmail.com
